

**UNIVERSITY FOR DEVELOPMENT STUDIES (UDS)
MINUTES OF THE SPECIAL AUDIT COMMITTEE (AC) MEETING
HELD VIA ZOOM AND IN THE COUNCIL CHAMBER, ROOM 140,
CENTRAL ADMINISTRATION ON THURSDAY, FEBRUARY 6, 2025**

ATTENDANCE

Members Present

- | | | |
|--------------------------|---|-------------------|
| 1. Dr. Felix Kwame Aveh | - | Chairman/Rep. IAA |
| 2. Ms. Clara Mama Asigri | - | Member/Rep. ICAG |
| 3. Mr. Abdulai Mohammed | - | Member/Rep. IAA |

Co-opted Members

- | | | |
|--------------------------------|---|------------------|
| 1. Prof. Seidu Al-hassan | - | Member/Rep. Mgt. |
| 2. Mr. Nurudeen Issah Abubakar | - | Member/Rep. Mgt. |

In Attendance

- | | | |
|---|---|-----------------------------|
| 1. Dr. Mohammed Hardi Shaibu | - | Director of Finance |
| 2. Mr. Abudulai Abubakari | - | Director of Internal Audit |
| 3. Ing. Prof. Felix Kofi Abagale | - | Director of WACWISA |
| 4. Mr. Muftawu Iddrisu | - | Accountant of WACWISA |
| 5. Mr. Safianu Mahama | - | Ag. Director of Procurement |
| 6. Mrs. Elizabeth Boye Kuranchie-Mensah | - | Secretary |

NO	DISCUSSIONS	ACTION
1.0	<p>OPENING</p> <p>The Chairman called the meeting to order at 10:10 am with an opening prayer by Ms. Clara Mama Asigri.</p>	
2.0	<p>WELCOME BY CHAIRMAN</p> <p>The Chairman welcomed all members to the Special Audit Committee meeting. The Chairman informed members that the agenda aims to look at the West Africa Centre for Water, Irrigation and Sustainable Agriculture (WACWISA) internal and external audit reports for the year ended December 31, 2024 and the reports have to be submitted to the World Bank by Wednesday,</p>	

February 12, 2025 but the external auditor's report has not yet been received and the Committee is scheduled to meet on Monday, February 2025 to discuss the external auditor's report.

3.0 OVERVIEW OF WACWISA PROJECT

The Chairman asked the Director of WACWISA to give a brief overview of the WACWISA project. The Director of WACWISA first and foremost expressed his appreciation to the Audit Committee of the University especially to the Chairman, the Vice-Chancellor, representatives from the Internal Audit Agency (IAA) and the Institute of Chartered Accountants, Ghana (ICAG) respectively on the Committee, the Director of Finance, the Registrar and the Director of Internal Audit for the support to the implementation of project activities.

The Director of WACWISA informed the Committee that the project commenced in 2019 with support from the Government of Ghana as well as the World Bank to improve the quality of education and the training of human resources at the higher levels of education in the University both at the Masters and PhD levels. He indicated that as at October last year, the Centre's rate of implementation was at 94 % of the results that has been achieved in terms of what has been presented to them in the form of what is referred to as Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLI). He disclosed that the Centre has since submitted some results and they are hoping to inch higher than the 94% that has been achieved.

The Director noted that they are in the closing session of the project and as part of the closing steps, the Audit Committee has to go through their internal and external audit reports to see whether the Centre is actually meeting what is required of them.

3.1 REMARKS FROM THE VICE-CHANCELLOR

The Vice-Chancellor, in his opening remarks, noted that the University Management is interested in the success of WACWISA and they have seen and heard the successes that the Centre has chalked over the period. He disclosed that he has personally benefited from programmes of the project and the latest being a capacity development workshop organized at the University of Ghana, Legon where Vice Chancellors of implementing Universities participated and this was noted to be very beneficial.

The Vice-Chancellor added that the Centre has influenced and impacted on the University and Management would always support the activity implementation and also he is hoping that the project life would be extended after the June 2025 date.

4.0	BUSINESS OF THE DAY (B.O.D)	
4.1	<p>INTERNAL AUDIT REPORT OF WACWISA FOR THE YEAR 2024</p> <p>The Director of Internal Audit informed the Committee that the essence of the meeting is to evaluate the financial, procurement and operational activities of WACWISA from January to December, 2024. He disclosed that the internal audit assesses compliance, efficiency and effectiveness while ensuring accountability and continuous improvement. He indicated that the audit serves as an independent appraisal to guide management in addressing gaps and optimizing resource utilization to achieve WACWISA’s objectives.</p> <p>The Director of Internal Audit stated that the internal audit aimed to assess internal controls, verify compliance with policies and regulations, identify risks and recommend mitigations, evaluate resource efficiency and enhance accountability and transparency. He mentioned that the scope of the audit covered the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Financial Management: Budgeting, Expenditure and Cash Management. ▪ Procurement: Policy Adherence and Contract Management. ▪ Operational Activities: Project Implementation, Resource Allocation and Monitoring. <p>The Director of Internal Audit informed the Committee that the methodology used was:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Interviews 2. Observations 3. Verifications 4. Questionnaires 5. Re-Performance 	
4.2	FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT	
4.2.1	<p>No Ledgers in the SAGE 300 Accounting Software</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Condition <p>The Internal Auditors noted that the Centre does not have ledgers in the Accounting Software (SAGE 300).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Recommendation <p>The Internal Auditors recommended that ledgers be prepared as prescribed by section 11 (ii) of WACWISA Financial Management Manual 2022 (revised).</p>	Accountant of WACWISA

<p>4.2.1</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Management Response <p>All the accounts of the Centre are prepared in the SAGE 300 as composite as there are no individual ledgers in the system for all projects under the Centre. Efforts will be made for the system managers to develop ledgers for each project.</p> <p>Audit Committee's Comment</p> <p>The Committee encouraged WACWISA to implement the Internal Auditors recommendation.</p> <p>Preparation of Bank Reconciliation Statements</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Condition <p>The Internal Auditors noted that monthly bank reconciliation statements were accurately prepared.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Commendation <p>The Internal Auditors commended the Finance team for preparing monthly bank reconciliation statements accurately for the period.</p> <p>Audit Committee's Comment</p> <p>The Committee acknowledged the commendation by the Internal Auditors.</p>	
<p>4.3</p>	<p>PROCUREMENT</p>	
<p>4.3.1</p>	<p>Non-Notification of Twenty-five (25) Unsuccessful Bidders</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Condition <p>The Internal Auditors noted that there were no written notifications to unsuccessful bidders for twenty-five (25) contracts.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Recommendation <p>The Internal Auditors recommended that unsuccessful bidders must be notified through writing.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Management Response <p>The recommendation is duly noted and the Directorate will notify all unsuccessful bidders in writing for price quotations.</p> <p>Audit Committee's Comment</p> <p>The Committee urged WACWISA to comply with the recommendation by the Internal Auditors because it is backed by law.</p>	<p>Ag. Director of Procurement</p>

<p>4.3.2</p>	<p>Failure to Sign Contract Agreements with Contractors</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Condition <p>The Internal Auditors noted that the Centre awarded 25 procurement contracts without signed contract agreements between the Centre and the Contractors.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Recommendation <p>The Internal Auditors recommended that the Directorate of Procurement must ensure that contract agreements are signed before work begins.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Management Response <p>The Directorate has taken notice of this and will ensure that suppliers sign their part of the agreement form as soon as possible before delivery.</p> <p>Audit Committee’s Comment</p> <p>The Committee agreed with the recommendation by the Internal Auditors.</p>	
<p>4.3.3</p>	<p>Non-Quarterly Update of Procurement Plan</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Condition <p>The Internal Auditors observed that WACWISA’s annual procurement plan was not quarterly updated as required.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Recommendation <p>The Internal Auditors recommended Update of procurement plans quarterly.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Management Response <p>The Procurement Plan is updated annually but this observation has been duly noted for compliance.</p> <p>Audit Committee’s Comment</p> <p>The Committee agreed with the recommendation by the Internal Auditors.</p>	
<p>4.4</p> <p>4.4.1</p>	<p>OPERATIONAL ACTIVITIES</p> <p>Failure to Hold Six (6) Scheduled Board Meetings</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Condition <p>The Internal Auditors noted that the Centre planned eleven (11) meetings for four different Boards. However, the Centre held only five (5) sessions, resulting in a shortfall of six (6) meetings.</p>	

- **Recommendation**

The Internal Auditors recommended the Centre to improve scheduling and use virtual platforms for its meetings.

- **Management Response**

The various Boards could not all meet their required meeting times due to many unplanned activities during the period. This was noted to have been caused by the several changes to the appointment dates of some members which had expired and therefore the inability of the Centre to hold the said meetings.

Also, the Sectoral Advisory Board Chair retired from active service and therefore affecting the meetings of that Board.

The recommendation was duly noted by the Centre Management for compliance.

Audit Committee's Comment

The Committee agreed with the recommendation by the Internal Auditors and advised the Director of the Centre to ensure that the Boards are duly constituted and meetings held.

4.4.2 Non-Installation of Lift

- **Condition**

The Internal Auditors noted that the Centre fell behind schedule to meet activity 10, action 4/DLI 4 of the 2024 Annual Work Plan - Installation of a Lift.

- **Recommendation**

The Internal Auditors recommended the Centre to accelerate installation.

- **Management Response**

This was delayed due to procurement challenges. However, the contract has been awarded and work is due to be completed in February 2025.

Comments

The Director of WACWISA explained to Committee members that the installation has started and from their reformulated plan, it would be due for completion in February 2025 but he is hopeful it would be completed even before the end of February 2025. The Registrar confirmed that he visited the Centre about two weeks ago and he saw that the installation was on-going. The above explanation was accepted by the Committee.

<p>4.4.3</p>	<p>Delays in Supporting Entrepreneurial Innovations</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Condition <p>The Internal Auditors observed that the Centre was not able to achieve DLI 5, under Relevance of Education and Research specifically: Activity 11: Supporting the School of Business to nurture entrepreneurial innovations by faculty and students (Entrepreneurship).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Recommendation <p>The Internal Auditors recommended enhance collaboration between WACWISA and the School of Business.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Management Response <p>Activity 11 was initially delayed due to some challenges but has now been achieved and submitted for verification.</p> <p>Comments</p> <p>A member wanted to find out why the delay and the Director explained that there were staff changes in the Department and the new staff had to abreast themselves with what was happening in terms of supporting in the Department. He indicated that the results have finally been achieved and submitted for verification.</p> <p>The Director of Internal Audit concluded that while challenges exist, WACWISA has made commendable progress. He therefore admonished WACWISA to adhere to the recommendations which will strengthen governance, financial management and overall effectiveness.</p>	
<p>5.0</p>	<p>ANY OTHER BUSINESS (A.O.B)</p>	
<p>5.1</p>	<p>Director of WACWISA</p>	
<p>5.2</p>	<p>Vice-Chancellor</p>	
<p>5.2</p>	<p>Vice-Chancellor</p>	
<p>5.2</p>	<p>The Vice-Chancellor thanked the Committee for the good work and assured members that the University Management will be available for the meeting on Monday, February 10, 2025.</p>	

<p>6.0</p>	<p>CHAIRMAN’S CLOSING REMARKS</p> <p>The Chairman thanked members of the Committee for making time for the Special Audit Committee meeting and indicated that the external members on the Committee are ever willing to support the University. He therefore informed members to make time for the next meeting which has been scheduled for Monday, February 10, 2025 at 2:00 pm.</p>	
<p>7.0</p>	<p>CLOSING</p> <p>In the absence of further deliberations, Ms. Clara Mama Asigri moved for the closure of the meeting and was seconded by Mr. Abdulai Mohammed. The closing prayer was said by Mr. Abdulai Mohammed.</p> <p>The meeting closed at 11:30 am.</p>	

Sign.....
 Dr. Felix Kwame Aveh
(Chairman)

Sign.....
 Mrs. Elizabeth Boye Kuranchie-Mensah
(Secretary)

**UNIVERSITY FOR DEVELOPMENT STUDIES (UDS)
MINUTES OF THE SPECIAL AUDIT COMMITTEE (AC) MEETING
HELD VIA ZOOM AND IN THE COUNCIL CHAMBER, ROOM 140, CENTRAL
ADMINISTRATION ON MONDAY, FEBRUARY 10, 2025**

ATTENDANCE

Members Present

- | | | |
|--------------------------|---|-------------------|
| 1. Dr. Felix Kwame Aveh | - | Chairman/Rep. IAA |
| 2. Ms. Clara Mama Asigri | - | Member/Rep. ICAG |
| 3. Mr. Abdulai Mohammed | - | Member/Rep. IAA |

Co-opted Members

- | | | |
|--------------------------------|---|------------------|
| 1. Prof. Seidu Al-hassan | - | Member/Rep. Mgt. |
| 2. Mr. Nurudeen Issah Abubakar | - | Member/Rep. Mgt. |

In Attendance

- | | | |
|---|---|-----------------------------|
| 1. Dr. Mohammed Hardi Shaibu | - | Director of Finance |
| 2. Mr. Abudulai Abubakari | - | Director of Internal Audit |
| 3. Ing. Prof. Felix Kofi Abagale | - | Director of WACWISA |
| 4. Mr. Muftawu Iddrisu | - | Accountant of WACWISA |
| 5. Mr. Safianu Mahama | - | Ag. Director of Procurement |
| 6. Mrs. Elizabeth Boye Kuranchie-Mensah | - | Secretary |

NO	DISCUSSIONS	ACTION
1.0	<p>OPENING</p> <p>The Chairman called the meeting to order at 2:20 pm with an opening prayer by 3.Mr. Abdulai Mohammed</p>	
2.0	<p>WELCOME BY CHAIRMAN</p> <p>The Chairman welcomed all members to the Special Audit Committee meeting and he informed members that the purpose of the meeting was to look at the West Africa Centre for Water, Irrigation and Sustainable Agriculture (WACWISA) external audit reports for the year ended December 31, 2024. He acknowledged that two main things were going to be considered which were:</p>	

	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Financial Audit and; 2. Procurement Audit 	
3.0	BUSINESS OF THE DAY (B.O.D)	
3.1	<p>PART I – MANAGEMENT LETTER FOR THE YEAR ENDED 31ST DECEMBER 2024</p> <p>The Director of Internal Audit presented the Management letter on the Financial Audit of the financial statement for the year ended 31st December, 2024.</p>	
3.2	FINANCIAL AUDIT	
3.2.1	<p>Review of Financial, Administrative and Internal Controls</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Finding <p>The External Auditors found that the Financial Management Manual for the Centre was the operational document used by the University alongside the Financial, Administrative and Internal Controls of the Project which were situated within UDS’s Financial, Administrative and Internal Controls with the related Public Financial Management Act, 2016 (Act 921), Public Financial Management Regulations, 2019 (LI 2378), the Public Procurement Act, 2003, Act 663, as amended by the Public Procurement Act 2016, Act, 914. To this extent, the Financial and Administrative authorities of UDS had an oversight control over the activities and funds of the Project. The Vice-Chancellor, Director of Finance and the Acting Director of Procurement of the University had oversight responsibilities in banking, payments transactions and procurement activities.</p> <p>External Auditor’s Comment</p> <p>There were no exceptions.</p>	
3.2.2	<p>Project Deliverables</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Finding <p>The External Auditors found that the University, per the agreement, was to achieve some set targets (deliverable) within specific time periods, after which subsequent funds would be released. Each target came with specific amounts of funds to be released to the University.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Issue <p>The External Auditors observed that the Centre was not able to receive the full benefit of achieving the various DLI expected.</p>	

- **Recommendation**

The External Auditors recommended that the Centre Management should ensure the results are achieved and submitted on time as required by donors as the project ends on the 30th June, 2025.

- **Management Response**

Except 5 activities out of the 18 lines of project results to be reported which have not been achieved, the remaining 13 have been fully achieved as reported in the above results earned table. These results were submitted to the auditors during the audit period for the financial year under review.

- **External Auditors' Response to Management Response**

Noted.

Audit Committee's Comment

The Committee encouraged WACWISA to strive and achieve all the set DLIs before the close of the project.

3.2.2 Sustainability of the Centre

- **Finding**

The External Auditors found that the Project was to cover a period of five (5) years, from 1st January, 2019 – 31st December, 2023 but has received a no-cost extension to 30th June, 2025. As part of the Contract agreement signed on 27th November, 2023 to extend the Project, the Financiers would no longer finance the operations of the Centre after the end of the Project on 30th June, 2025.

- **Recommendation**

The External Auditors recommended the following:

1. Management should assess the “going concern” of the Centre and put in place short-term, medium and long-term programmes to sustain of the Centre.
2. Management should provide a succession plan for the Centre.

- **Management Response**

This is noted and arrangements will be made in respect of this.

External Auditors' Response to Management Response

Noted.

Audit Committee's Comment

The Committee encouraged Management of WACWISA to implement strategies that will contribute to sustainability of the Centre.

3.2.3**Bank Accounts**

- **Finding**

The External Auditors found that the Project operated from two current bank accounts as at 31st December, 2024 with Ecobank Tamale branch. Details listed below:

<u>Bank Account</u>	<u>Bank</u>	<u>Branch</u>	<u>Currency</u>	<u>Account Number</u>
Foreign Currency	Ecobank	Tamale	US Dollar	3441002201436
Local Currency	Ecobank	Tamale	Ghana Cedi	1441002238711

External Auditors' Comment

There were no exceptions.

Audit Committee's Comment

The Committee noted that there were no exceptions and commended the Centre on this.

3.2.4**Bank Reconciliation Statement**

- **Finding**

Section 11 sub-section (iv) of the Financial Management Manual states that; "Bank reconciliation of the funds will also be prepared by the Financial Management Coordinator and endorsed by the Director of Finance and Director of the Centre.

External Auditors' Comment

There were no exceptions.

Audit Committee's Comment

The Committee commended the Centre Management in following laid down rules and procedures.

3.2.5**Remittance**

- **Finding**

The External Auditors found that the Project received two grants from the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development (IBRD) International Development Association (IDA) during the year under review.

DATE	RECEIVED FROM	AMOUNT US\$
21-Mar-2024	GTEC	760,057.53
20-Aug-2024	GTEC	88,591.95
Total		848,649.48

External Auditors' Comment

There were no exceptions.

Audit Committee's Comment

The Committee noted the funds received from the World Bank for the period and commended them for the efforts in achieving more results and funds.

3.2.6

Investment of Project Funds

- **Findings**

Section 139 of Public Financial Management Regulations, 2019 L.I. 2378 states that a “Financial instrument for the purposes of section 49 of the Act, a financial instrument includes:

- (a) a deposit account, (g) loans,
- (b) shares, (h) receivables,
- (c) bonds, (i) derivatives,
- (d) bills, (j) repurchase agreements, and
- (e) commercial papers (k) any other Instrument
- (f) notes,

Section 140 regulation 2 of Public Financial Management Regulations, 2019 L.I. 2378 also states that “The Minister shall authorise investment in any financial instrument; and ensure that investments in financial instruments are consistent with the fiscal strategy of Government”.

- **Exception**

On 7th November, 2024, a request from the Finance Manager of the Project to Director of Finance was approved to invest US\$500,000.00 in Ecobank. An investment certificate obtained during the audit and movement in the Cashbook and Bank Statement obtained indicated transfer of funds for a 91 day bill with Ecobank Repo (a financial instrument) at an interest rate of 1.5% to be rollover with interest. There was no evidence of authorization of this Financial Instrument from the Minister.

- **Recommendations**

The External Auditors recommended the following:

1. Approval of Investment should be sought for, for the purpose of ratification of the decision or,
2. Investment should be cancelled.
3. The purpose for which the funds was obtained should be adhered to.

- **Management Response**

Management noted the issue and recommendation.

- **External Auditors' Response to Management Response**

Copies of request for approval to Minister and disinvestment of the investment should be made available as soon as possible.

Audit Committee's Comment

The Committee discussed the issue of the investment as a good strategy to support the sustainability initiatives of the Centre but however noted the External Auditors Response to Management. The Committee noted that since the funds are on call, there will not be delay effect on implementation of activities.

3.2.7

Engagement of Research Assistants

- **Finding**

Section 12 (1) of the Labour Act 2003 states that; “The employment of a worker by an employer for a period of six months or more or for a number of working days equivalent to six months or more within a year shall be secured by a written contract of employment”.

The National Pensions Act, 2008 Act 766 Section 1 states that;

There is established by this Act, a contributory three-tier pension scheme consisting of

- a. A mandatory basic national social security scheme
- b. A mandatory fully funded and privately managed occupational pension scheme and,
- c. A voluntary fully and privately managed provident fund and personal pension scheme.

- **Exception**

The Centre engaged 3 Field Research Assistants under CIRAWA for the period 1st January, 2024 to 31st December, 2024. The appointment letter stated that they will be receiving a monthly stipend though there were employed for more than a Six-month period.

Below are the names of the engaged persons;

NAME	POSITION	PERIOD
Augustina Aduku	Field Research Assistant	1 st Jan. 2024 - 31 st Dec. 2024
Doreen Domebesoa Aviela Derzu	Research Assistant	1 st Jan. 2024 - 31 st Dec. 2024
Philemon Ayambila	Field Research Assistant	1 st Jan. 2024 - 31 st Dec. 2024

- **Recommendation**

The External Auditors recommended that the Centre should ensure that all engaged contract staff for a period more than six month enjoys the appropriate benefits as enjoyed by a permanent staff.

- **Management Response**

Management has taken note of the Issue raised and will take necessary steps in this regard. However, the project funds of this particular project – CIRAWA are being moved to the mainstream University project management system and therefore the recommendation will be handled by mainstream University.

External Auditors' Response to Management Response

Management response noted.

Audit Committee's Comment

The Committee discussed the issue and concluded that as the matter will be settled with the University taking over the project, then there was no issue. The however caution Management to always refer to the rules governing such engagements.

3.2.8

Payment Vouchers

- **Findings**

Section 78 of Public Financial Management Regulations, 2019 L.I. 2378 states that A Principal Spending Officer of a covered entity is personally responsible for ensuring in respect of each payment of that covered entity,

- (a) the validity, accuracy and legality of the claim for the payment;
- (b) that evidence of services received, certificates for work done and any other supporting documents exists.

Section 5 of the Financial and Management Manual of the Centre states that:

- i. All payments are backed by approved and authorized requests and supporting document
- i. Payment Voucher (PV) is prepared for each approved and authorized payment request and endorsed by the Financial Management Coordinator.
- ii. A Letter requesting direct transfer by the bank to payee is prepared and endorsed by signatories to the account.
- iii. The letter is sent to the Bank for the transfer to be effected and a stamped copy is returned and filed together with the request for payment and other supporting documents.
- iv. The procedure stated above is the same for processing payments for goods and services as well as advances.

- **Exception**

No VAT invoice and inspection report were attached to these payment vouchers:

DATE	DETAILS	PAYEE	PV NUMBER	AMOUNT US\$
27-Feb-2024	Payment for air tickets for IRAD Conference	Global Wings Travel and Tours	PV231621	236.89
27-Feb-2024	Payment for air tickets of officials to Cape Verde	Global Wings Travel and Tours	PV231623	2,203.61
12-Apr-2024	Air Tickets for official trip to Cape Verde	Global Wings Travel and Tours	PV232725	497.14
12-Apr-2024	Air Tickets for official trip to Accra and back in	Global Wings Travel and Tours	PV232728	537.90

DATE	DETAILS	PV NUMBER	PAYEE	AMOUNT US \$
17-Dec-24	Payment for fabrication and installation of shade net stands	PV238448	Munto Welding and Fabrication	5,403.13
5-Jan-24	Payment for supply and installation of lab. Equipment - lot 3	PV230402	Wagtech Ghana Limited	101,678.36

Additionally, boarding passes or copies of it for these trips were not retired.

- **Recommendations**

The External Auditors recommended that Management should ensure that all payment vouchers were accompanied by the necessary supporting documents, including the VAT invoice and inspection document, in line with the mandates of Act 921 and Act 663.

- **Management Response**

Management took note of the issue and recommendation and indicated that the contract details titled "Payment for fabrication and installation of shade net stands" with PV238448 was

awarded as works with package number NR/UDS/WACWISA/WK/006/24 was awarded as works and therefore did not require a VAT invoice.

PV230402 had a VAT invoice number 23/2294115 dated 19/12/2023 attached to the Payment voucher.

Management also duly noted the issue and recommendation on boarding passes raised for compliance.

External Auditors’ Response to Management Response

Noted for subsequent review.

Audit Committee’s Comment

The Committee discussed the matter thoroughly and indicated that as the evidence on the External Auditors exception has been given by Management of the Centre, the issue was no more an infraction. The Centre Management was encouraged to always meet the legal requirements of taxes in the country.

3.2.9 Delays in Request Date and Fund Release Date

- **Finding**

According to the Centers Financial Manual (Revised 2022) Section 7 on Cash Advances states that;

- a) When necessary, cash advances are given to officials to undertake activities which require urgent attention and whose exact cost cannot be determined.

- **Exception**

During the audit of payment vouchers for field and fuel assistance related to a tree plantation project, it was noted that the date recorded on the request for assistance and the date on which the funds were released are significantly apart.

DATE OF REQUEST	DATE	DETAILS	PV NUMBER	PAYEE	AMOUNT US\$
26-June-24	13-Dec-24	Advance for fuel and payment of field assistants	PV238306	Richard Osei Agyemang	1,904.25
26-June-24	13-Dec-24	Advance for fuel and payment of field assistants	PV238304	Richard Osei Agyemang	1,904.25

- **Recommendations**

The External Auditors recommended the following:

1. Review and reinforce the internal control mechanisms governing fund disbursement. Measures should ensure that every request is processed within a reasonable period.
2. Establish and enforce clear protocols that define maximum allowable time intervals between request submission and fund release.
3. Improve communication channels between the requesting and finance departments. Regular coordination meetings and follow-ups can help ensure that the documentation dates match the disbursement dates.

- **Management Response**

Management duly noted the Exception, Issue and Recommendations for implementation to avoid future occurrence.

- **External Auditors' Response to Management Response**

Noted.

Audit Committee's Comment

The Committee encouraged WACWISA to make efforts to always release funds on timely manner to help meet project deliverables.

3.2.10 Fixed Assets

- **Finding**

The External Auditors found that the Centre's manual of Receipt of Goods states; 'All items purchased under WACWISA must be inspected by the Procurement Specialist, the Store Keeper and the user or Director of the Centre and vouched by the Auditor'.

Again, the Public Financial Management Regulation on Fixed Assets also states in Section 156 subsection 2; 'The Fixed Assets Coordinating Unit shall (a) assist the Principal Spending Officer to take an inventory of fixed assets and (b) keep records on fixed assets. In view of the fact that a Fixed Asset Register has been kept in the required manner, there are no exceptions and 60% of assets were inspected by the team.

Audit Committee's Comment

The Committee noted that there were no issues related to fixed assets and fixed assets register of the Centre and commended the Centre for meeting the requirements of the laws.

4.0	<p>PART II – DISCUSSION ON PROCUREMENT REPORT</p>	
4.1	<p>Procurement Process and Institutional Capacity</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Finding <p>The External Auditors found that as the Centre is run by the University, it complied with Public Procurement Act 2003, Act 663 as amended by Public Procurement Act 2016, Act 914 of Ghana and the World Bank Guidelines, policies, procedures and standards on procurement of goods, works, non- consulting services and consulting services and processes approved by the Public Procurement Authority (PPA) Ghana.</p> <p>These required that the University had the following structures available:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) The Head of Entity (b) Functional Procurement Directorate Entity Tender Committee (c) Tender Opening Panel (Ad-hoc) (d) Tender Evaluation Panel (Ad-hoc) <p>External Auditors’ Comment</p> <p>There were no exceptions.</p> <p>Audit Committee’s Comment</p> <p>The Committee noted that the External Auditors did not raise exceptions to the Centre activities on this and encouraged the Management.</p>	
4.2	<p>Procurement Plan</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Finding <p>Section 21 of the Public Procurement Act 2003, Act 663 amended states that</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) “a procurement entity shall prepare a procurement plan to support its approved programme. (2) The plan shall indicate <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) contract packages, description or lots, b) estimated cost for each package, c) the procurement method approvals needed, and d) processing steps and times. <p>The External Auditors noted that a procurement plan was made available during the audit, appropriateness of the plan, designs, specifications to meet the intended project objectives were assessed. Approval and timelines of the plan was also assessed.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Exception <p>The following activities could not be carried out as at the end of the year under review:</p>	

Contract Package	Package No.	Estimated	
		US\$	
Curtains	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/012/24	2,692.31	
Vehicle Tyres - 215/70 R17.5	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/014/24	2,846.15	
Vehicle Tyres - 235/65 R16C	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/016/24	1,923.08	

- **Recommendation**

The External Auditors recommended that management should ensure that the Procurement Plan of the Centre is adhered to and where necessary reviewed.

- **Management Response**

Tyres are procured when there is the need for replacement resulting from wearing or busting of the vehicle tyres and therefore planned procurement of tyres may not be necessary when the need has not arisen. However, under the period of this report, procurement of tyres and batteries was done by Rexboah Enterprise and which the supply period has been raised as an exception in this report on page 20 item number 18.2

The decision to provide curtains for offices was changed and therefore there was no need to install curtains in the offices.

External Auditors' Response to Management Response

The External Auditors noted Management's response and indicated that the Procurement plan indicated the need for these items as stated above. Management should try considering the need for items before adding it to the plan for the year. The tyres not procured were of different specification compared to the one purchased from Rexboah Enterprise.

Audit Committee's Comment

The Committee noted the issue at stake and discussed that since the Centre did not need the items, there was no need to procure them as they have expiry date.

4.3

Breach of Threshold

- **Finding**

Section 18 (3f) of the Public Procurement Act 2003, Act 663 as amended states that "(3) The head of entity shall (f) refer to the entity tender committee for approval, a procurement above the approval threshold of the head of entity.

Section 4 also states that (4) The head of entity shall (a) apply the thresholds that relate to heads of entities as specified in the Second and Third Schedules to this Act”

The University falls under Category C of the Public Procurement Act 2003, Act 663 as amended under the First Schedule which states that

CATEGORY C

1. Head Office of subvented agencies and government departments
2. Teaching Hospitals
3. Tertiary Institutions including autonomous schools, institutes, colleges and campuses of universities.

Threshold for Head of Entity under the Second Schedule

Goods GHS	Works GHS	Services GHS
Up 100,000	Up 150,000	Up 100,000

- **Exception**

The External Auditors observed that the following procurement sighted were above the head of entity threshold, however there was no evidence that it was referred to Entity Tender Committee as stipulated by the Act.

Date of Payment	Description	Company	Payment GHS	Payment US\$ Equivalent
11-July-24	Contract for the construction of 1NO. Pavilion for WACWISA 90 persons use	Zy Company Limited	194,215.00	14,939.62
11-July-24	Contract for the construction of 1NO. Pavilion with mounted container to serve as eatery.	Fm Zanjina Enterprise Limited	199,985.40	15,383.50

11-July-24	Contract for the construction of pavement and chain-link fence around Pavilions	Fm Zanjina Enterprise Limited 2NO.	183,200.00	14,092.31
------------	---	------------------------------------	------------	-----------

- **Recommendation**

Management should ensure compliance with the Act in this respect and if evidence of the Entity Committee approval is available should be filed and made available for inspection.

- **Management Response**

Management indicated that the three (3) contracts were sent to Tender Committee for ratification and evidence is captured in the minutes of the Tender Committee meeting held on December 4, 2024.

External Auditors’ Response to Management Response

Noted for subsequent review. However, Management should ensure that laid down processes are adhered to.

Audit Committee’s Comment

The Committee encouraged the University and the WACWISA Centre to always meet the required legal instruments relating to thresholds and commended the Management for forwarding the matter to the Tender Committee for ratification as presented.

4.4 Price Competitiveness

- **Finding**

According to the External Auditors, a critical review was made on the tender process with a view to determining the cost of procurement to the entity, and deviation of winning bids from the entity’s budget. In addition, the assessment aimed at determining whether procurement contracts were competitively priced by bidders.

An average of three (3) bidders were recorded per lot (for 1 lot) which reaffirms the predominant usage of RFQ for the Centre’s procurement. When RFQ is used, the client is expected to receive and compare a minimum of three bids. Per the standard procurement guidelines, this should guarantee competition and ensure price reasonableness for procuring limited quantities of readily available off-the-shelf goods or standard specification commodities of small value, or

simple civil works of small value, a minimum average of 3 bids prices were available for comparison. This feature was dominant with Price Quotation bids.

- **Exception**

The External Auditors observed the following material variance were noted between the actuals and the budgeted amounts.

Contract Package	Package No.	Estimated	Actual	Difference
		US\$	US\$	US\$
Conference Materials for IRAD 2024	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/002/24	9,765.38	6,487.20	3,278.18
Wall and Desktop Calendars	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/004/24	1250.00	5,320.00	(4,070.00)
Laboratory Reagents	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/005/24	5,567.15	1,287.20	4,279.95
Laboratory Glassware and Consumables	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/007/24	5,582.69	1,977.92	3,604.77
Printers (2 colour, 6 black and white)	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/008/24	5,384.62	7,028.00	(1,643.38)
Office Consumables	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/010/24	1,846.15	3,928.00	(2,081.85)
Vehicle Tyres - 245/65 R1617	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/015/24	2,307.69	300.00	2,007.69
Vehicle Tyres - 285/65 R18	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/017/24	1,923.08	1,664.00	259.08
Supply of Materials for Construction of Laboratory Work bench	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/021/24	846.15	804.24	3,855.65

- **Recommendation**

Specific capacity building and training of procurement officers on Estimation and Budgeting for the Centre to prevent future occurrence. Where a review of plan is necessary, Management should ensure that it is carried out.

- **Management Response**

Recommendation on the exception and issue were duly noted for compliance by Management.

External Auditors' Response to Management Response

Noted for subsequent review.

Audit Committee's Comment

The Committee noted the price volatility in the Country but urged the Centre Management to as much as possible budget to a higher degree of closeness to the market value to avoid variances.

4.5

Procurement Methods and Deliverables

- **Finding**

Section 35 of the Public Procurement Act 2003 Act 663 as amended by Public Procurement Act 2016, Act 914 states that "the procurement entity may conduct procurement by means of the following methods and as from time to time determined by Regulations:

- (a) competitive tendering that includes;
 - (i) international competitive tendering
 - (ii) national competitive tendering
 - (iii) request for quotations and
 - (iv) restricted tendering;
- (b) single source procurement;
- (c) selection of consultants determined by
 - (i) quality and cost-based selection,
 - (ii) quality based selection,
 - (iii) selection based on consultant's qualification,
 - (iv) least cost selection,
 - (v) fixed budget selection,
 - (vi) single source selection; and
- (d) framework contracting where
 - (i) the Board in consultation with the Minister, may introduce framework contracting agreements and other methods for any specific entity where the context permits until it is possible to do so nationally; and

a procurement entity may engage in a framework agreement procedure in accordance with regulations or guidelines issued by the Board

2) These methods shall be used subject to and in accordance with the thresholds specified in the Fifth Schedule.

Assessments were made on the tender processes with aim of ensuring whether the tender process complied with Public Procurement Act 2003, Act 663 and its Regulations.

Issues such as extension of time, delays, variation orders, claims analysis, price fluctuations, payment procedures, dispute resolutions, contract terminations.

The team inspected available test certificates/reports and other quality assurance and control tools. The quality of goods delivered and works executed were certified as having met the specifications stated in the contract documents were met in accordance with opinion of the stores office of the University.

Request for Quotation (RFQ) was the dominant method of procurement. There were one (1) National Competitive Tendering.

- **Recommendation**

Management should ensure that suppliers abide by the time provided in the contract or provide a more realistic time for suppliers.

- **Management Response**

Management mentioned that payment periods are different from the delivery periods indicated in the contract letters and gave an example of listed items relating to Ramsfad Restaurant which were for restaurant services and therefore could not have been supplied after the events had taken place. Management further indicated that it will ensure that suppliers abide by the delivery time specified in contract documents.

External Auditors' Response to Management Response

Payment periods were not listed but delivery.

Audit Committee's Comment

The Committee requested the Management to ensure that delivery time in contracts are made realistic to avoid delays in supply of goods, services and works.

4.6

Sourcing and Payment of Suppliers

- **Findings**

The External Auditors found the following:

1. Sourcing for suppliers, contractors and consultants for the procurement activities were examined. The selection of suppliers for Price Quotation was done by using the supplier database of the Public Procurement Authority.
2. There was evidence that the request for quotations were made formally.
3. Letters of invitations to the suppliers and standard request for quotation document were sighted.

4. Tender openings were done publicly and signed minutes of tender openings were available.
5. The Centre recorded no delay in payments of invoices submitted by various contractors, suppliers and consultants.

External Auditors' Comment

There were no exceptions

Audit Committee's Comment

The Committee commended the Centre for not having exceptions related to sourcing and payment of suppliers.

4.7

Record Keeping

- **Finding**

Section 28 of the Public Procurement Act 2003, (Act 663) as amended states that a procurement entity shall maintain a record of the procurement proceedings also Section 1.10.3 of the Public Procurement Manual, 2003 also provides details of the records that every procurement file must contain from initiation to the end.

All documents regarding a particular procurement shall be kept for future reference and monitoring and control purposes. The recommended filing structure for a record of procurement shall include the following documentation:

Original Request from Originating Officer, Correspondence with Originating Officer.
 Correspondence with Suppliers, Contractors and Consultants/ (pre-order only) Internal Correspondence within Procurement Unit, Requests for Expressions of Interest, Shortlist or Advertisement, Tender documents and Specifications/Terms of Reference, Correspondence with suppliers relating to Tender, Tenders, Quotations or Pro-forma invoices received, Tender opening records, Record of Tender Securities and release, Evaluation Report, Submission to the relevant authority & Minutes of proceeding Notice of Contract Award and publication, Contract/Purchase Order & Acknowledgement of receipt, Delivery/Executions Documentation, Inspection and Acceptance Reports, After sales warranty and performance claims, Copy of Record of Commitment of Funds (A&EI Form), Copy of Invoices or Certificates, Copy of Payment Vouchers Manuals.

- **Exception**

There were no copies of payment voucher attached or on file.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Recommendation <p>The External Auditors recommended that the Procurement Unit should liaise with the Finance Department of the University and obtain copies of all payment vouchers and keep them on file.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Management Response <p>Management indicated that Payment Vouchers are filed by the Finance Department. Management has noted the recommendation and will henceforth duly provide copies of payment vouchers as attachments to procurements as recommended.</p> <p>External Auditors' Response to Management Response</p> <p>Noted for subsequent review.</p> <p>Audit Committee's Comment</p> <p>The Committee encouraged Management to ensure that copies of Payment Vouchers for procured items are made available and attached to the procurement documents.</p>	
5.0	ANY OTHER BUSINESS (A.O.B)	
5.1	Director of WACWISA	
	The Director of WACWISA thanked the Committee for their continuous support.	
5.2	Vice-Chancellor	
	The Vice-Chancellor thanked the Committee for their participation.	
6.0	CHAIRMAN'S CLOSING REMARKS	
	The Chairman thanked members of the Committee for making time for the Special Audit Committee meeting.	
7.0	CLOSING	
	In the absence of further deliberations, Ms. Clara Mama Asigri moved for the closure of the meeting and was seconded by Mr. Abdulai Mohammed.	
	The meeting closed at 4:02 pm.	



Sign.....
Dr. Felix Kwame Aveh
(Chairman)



Sign.....
Mrs. Elizabeth Boye Kuranchie-Mensah
(Secretary)