# UNIVERSITY FOR DEVELOPMENT STUDIES (UDS) MINUTES OF SPECIAL AUDIT COMMITTEE MEETING HELD IN THE COUNCIL CHAMBER AND VIA ZOOM ON MONDAY, AUGUST 12, 2024

# **ATTENDANCE**

# **Members Present**

Dr. Felix Kwame Aveh
 Ms. Clara Mama Asigri
 Member/Rep. ICAG

# **Co-opted Members**

Prof. Seidu Al-hassan
 Member/Rep. Mgt.
 Mr. Nurudeen Issah Abubakar
 Member/Rep. Mgt.

# In Attendance

1. Dr. Mohammed Hardi Shaibu - Director of Finance

2. Mr. Abudulai Abubakari - Director of Internal Audit

3. Prof. Felix Kofi Abagale - Director of WACWISA

4. Mr. Safianu Mahama - Ag. Director of Procurement

5. Mr. Muftawu Iddrisu - Accountant of WACWISA

6. Mrs. Elizabeth Boye Kuranchie-Mensah - Secretary

# **Absent with Apology**

1. Mr. Abdulai Mohammed - Rep. IAA

2. Prof. Edmund Muomir Der - Rep. UDS Governing Council

3. Mrs. Matilda Awiah Azuimah, Esq, - Rep. UDS Governing Council

NO.	DISCUSSIONS	ACTION
1.0	OPENING	
	The Chairman called the meeting to order at 10:08 am with an opening prayer by Mr. Nurudeen I. Abubakar.	
2.0	WELCOME	
	The Chairman welcomed and thanked members for making time for the Special Audit Committee Meeting and called upon the Director of Internal Audit to inform members about the purpose of the meeting.	

The Director of Internal Audit informed members that, the purpose of the meeting is to discuss the West Africa Centre for Water, Irrigation and Sustainable Agriculture (WACWISA) internal and external audit reports. He added that, the reports have to be submitted to the World Bank before August 14, 2024, hence, the need for special meeting to be held.

The Chairman asked each member to declare his or her Conflict of Interest on the Agenda and in the absence of any expression of Conflict of Interest, Ms. Clara Mama Asigri moved for the adoption of the agenda and was seconded by Mr. Nurudeen I. Abubakar.

# 3.0 BUSINESS OF THE DAY

# 3.1 EXTERNAL AUDIT REPORTS FOR THE YEAR ENDED 31<sup>ST</sup> DECEMBER, 2023 - WEST AFRICA CENTRE FOR WATER, IRRIGATION AND SUSTAINABLE AGRICULTURE (WACWISA)

The Director of Internal Audit presented the summary of findings and recommendations of the external audit reports to the Committee. Below are summary of key findings and recommendation(s):

# 3.2 FINDINGS- FINANCIAL AUDIT

# 3.2.1 REVIEW OF FINANCIAL, ADMINISTRATIVE AND INTERNAL CONTROLS

The Director of Internal Audit reported that, there were no exceptions.

# 3.2.2 PROJECT DELIVERABLES

# **Condition**

The Centre was not able to receive the full benefit of achieving the various Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs) expected.

# Recommendation

The Centre Management should ensure the results are achieved and submitted on time as required by donors.

# **Comment**

The Committee agreed with the recommendation by the External Auditors.

# 3.2.3 BANK ACCOUNTS

The Director of Internal Audit reported that, there were no exceptions.

# 3.2.4 BANK RECONCILIATION STATEMENT

The Director of Internal Audit reported that, there were no exceptions.

# 3.2.5 REMITTANCE - USD 1,498,295.27

The Director of Internal Audit reported that, there were no exceptions.

# 3.2.6 PAYMENT OF GOODS AND SERVICES

#### **Condition**

1. The Director of Internal Audit reported that, two payments had the same PV numbers. Below are details of payments:

DATE	DETAILS	PAYEE	PV NO.	AMOUNT
7-Nov-23	Driver's Per diem for	Munkaila	PV229116	\$123.00
	official trip to Cape Coast	Iddrisu		
6-Nov-2023	Reimbursement of	Bernard	PV229116	\$440.53
	Imprest/Administrative	Alando		
	Coordinator			

# 2. Duplicated Payment in Cash book with no Payment Voucher number.

DATE	DETAILS	PAYEE	AMOUNT
		Sonia	
06-Feb-23	Stipend for January 2023 – Sonia	Ikundabayo	\$108.75
06-Feb-23	Stipend for January 2023 duplicated – Sonia	Sonia Ikundabayo	\$108.75

#### Recommendation

Management should ensure that all payments are always cross-checked to avoid duplication.

# **Management Response**

- There was a network failure of the system during the PV generation and this sometimes results in duplication of PV numbers.
- ii. Payment was made to all WACWISA scholarship students on 23/01/23 but Sonia's own was returned unpaid and was mistakenly re-presented twice by the bank for payment on 06/02/23, resulting in the duplication of payment.
- iii. This was discussed with the student and agreement was reached to offset the second payment against her stipend for the month of April 2023 which was the same as the duplicated amount paid.

# Comment

The Committee noted that, Sonia's issue was emanating from the bank and for that matter, it should not have been treated in the Cash book but rather reconciliation.

# 3.2.7 TAX IRREGULARITY- NON-COLLECTION OF VAT INVOICES Condition

Two payments were not accompanied with VAT invoices.

DATE	DETAILS	PAYEE	PV NO.	AMOUNT\$
24-Nov-	Cost of Conference	Best	PV2294	
2023	Package for Writeshop	Western	78	2,343.34
		Premier		
15-Feb-	Request for funds for field	Prof.	PV2217	3,245.00
2023	work	Ganiyu	13	
		Shaibu		

# Recommendation

Management should ensure VAT invoices and receipts where applicable are provided as soon as payment is done.

# **Management Response**

This is noted and efforts are being made to get the VAT invoices.

# **Comments**

The Director of WACWISA explained that, the tax irregularities relate to two projects other than the World Bank/Government of Ghana funding. He mentioned that, the VAT from Best Western Premier has been obtained and efforts are being made for Prof. Shaibu to submit a VAT receipt for the payments made.

However, a member advised that, tax irregularities must be taken very seriously and also, steps must be made to pay the tax directly to the Ghana Revenue Authority (GRA) and they would be issued with VAT receipts.

# 3.2.8 CASH ADVANCE

#### Condition

The following Cash Advances issued were above the threshold of US\$5,000:

DATE	DETAILS	PAYEE	PV NO.	AMOUNT \$
1 Mar 2023	Advance to cater for other	Prof.Saa	Trf2023/25	45,200.00
	expenses of officials on trip to	Dittoh		
	Senegal, Cape Verde and the			
	Gambia under CIRAWA			
26-Jun-	Funds released for field work	Dr. Kudadam	PV225985	5,709.09
2023	UNIDO	Joseph Korese		
5-Jan-2023	Funds Released for CIRAWA	Prof. Saa	Trf2023/01	5,200.00
	draft implementation meeting	Dittoh		
1-March-	Funds released for field	Prof. Saa	Trf2023/23	18,782.61
2023	activities under CIRAWA	Dittoh		

# Recommendations

Management to ensure that its own policies are adhered to.

# **Management Response**

The UNIDO and CIRAWA projects are managed by Project Investigators who are staff of WACWISA. There was the need for a concurrent fieldwork to be undertaken in the four (4) countries, i.e. Senegal, Cape Verde, Gambia and Ghana and the advances were written in the name of the Project Investigator thus causing the exception raised. This is noted and steps will be taken to minimize the amounts advanced to Principal Investigators by making direct transfer of funds to third parties involved in respective project activities.

# **Comment**

A member suggested that, the Centre must ensure that advances above the policy threshold are not paid to one person but paid directly to individuals and service providers to avoid these breaches.

# 3.2.9 IMPREST REPLENISHMENTS

# Condition

A total of US\$6,508.65 was released as imprest in 2023. Funds released on 9<sup>th</sup> February, 2023 and 22<sup>nd</sup> March, 2023 were above \$500.

The time interval shows that imprest were reimbursed more than once for the months of July, August and November 2023.

#### Recommendation

Management should abide by the Public Financial Management Regulations, 2019 on impress ceiling.

# **Management Response**

There was the urgent need at certain times for the supply of drinking water to the Centre and therefore the petty cash was used in this regard thus causing the exception. Exception is duly noted and compliance will be ensured.

# **Comment**

The Committee agrees with the recommendation by the External Auditors.

# 3,2.10 OFFICIAL RECEIPTS

#### **Condition**

A payment (PV No. PV229694) made to UDS library amounting to \$663.44 had a receipt and invoice without any unique reference number.

# Recommendation

Management should ensure that receipts which have all features as required by Public Financial Management Regulation, 2019 section 53 are accepted as evidence of payments.

# **Management Response**

This is noted and payments made will demand receipts having all the features.

# **Comment**

The Committee agrees with the recommendation by the External Auditors.

# 3.2.11 FIXED ASSETS

The Director of Internal Audit reported that, there were no exceptions.

# 3.3 PROCUREMENT

# 3.3.1 PROCUREMENT PROCESS AND INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY

# **Condition**

No conflict-of-interest declaration forms were seen for all the procurement contracts audited.

# Recommendation

Management should ensure Signing Conflict of Interest declaration forms by all Evaluation Panel members prior to start of bids evaluation.

# **Management Response**

As far as possible no third-party transactions came to our attention and hence all transactions were at arm's length. Recommendation is duly noted for implementation.

# Comment

The Ag. Director of Procurement explained that, as at the time of the audit, there were no conflicts of interest declaration forms but currently, the Centre has started using the forms.

# 3.3.2 PROCUREMENT PLAN

#### Condition

Ten (10) planned procurement activities could not be carried out as at the end of the year under review.

# Recommendation

Management should ensure that the Procurement Plan of the Centre is adhered to.

# **Management Response**

		Estimate	Responses		
		d US \$			
Contract Package	Package No.				
		65,714.29	Three different procurements		
			advertisements and processes were		
Supply and			undertaken in 2023 to secure a		
Installation of Lift			contractor/supplier but could not secure a		
for WACWISA	NR/UDS/WACWIS		contract/supplier. It is expected that a lift		
Block	A/GD/001/23		will be procured in the year 2024		
Supply and		20,000.00	There was a delay in the procurement due to		
Installation of	NR/UDS/WACWIS		budget differentials but the process was		
Laboratory	A/GD/003/23		completed in 2023		

Equipment for			
Nordic Project			
Supply of Cleaning		5,238.09	The stock in store was not exhausted so, this
Materials and			activity was not undertaken.
Cleaning Tools for	NR/UDS/WACWIS		
WACWISA Block	A/GD/007/23		
Supply of Metal	NR/UDS/WACWIS	1,428.57	Due to limited budget, this could not be
Safe	A/GD/008/23		carried out
Supply and		4,761.90	This activity was change to a new one to
Installation of	NR/UDS/WACWIS		obtain printers for responsible office holders
Printer and Scanner	A/GD/009/23		in 2024
Supply of Office	NR/UDS/WACWIS	4,761.90	There was some stock of office consumables
Consumables	A/GD/010/23		so activity was not undertaken
Supply of Souvenirs	NR/UDS/WACWIS	7,619.04	This activity was not undertaken because
for WACWISA	A/GD/012/23		there was still some souvenirs in store.
Supply of 1No.		1,200.00	Due to budget limitation, this activity could
Motorcycle for	NR/UDS/WACWIS		not be done.
Delivery Services	A/GD/027/23		
Supply of Reagents		6,600.00	Due to budget limitation this could not be
for WACWISA	NR/UDS/WACWIS		undertaken
Laboratory	A/GD/028/23		
Supply of		6,500.00	There was a delay in the process but the
Glassware and			activity will be done in 2024
Consumables for			
WACWISA	NR/UDS/WACWIS		
Laboratory	A/GD/029/23		

# **Comment**

The Director of WACWISA explained that as at 2023, the procurement of the lift was not done but currently, the lift has been procured. Also, Supply and Installation of Laboratory Equipment for Nordic Project, Supply and Installation of Printer and Scanner, Supply of Reagents for WACWISA Laboratory and Supply of Glassware and Consumables for WACWISA Laboratory were all completed in the first half of 2024. The others will be completed in the second half of 2024.

Director, WACWIS A

# 3.3.3 PRICE COMPETITIVENESS

# **Condition**

The following variance were noted between the actuals and the budgeted amounts:

Contract Package	Package No.	Estimated US\$	Actual US\$	Variance US\$	(%)
	1 ackage 110.	72.380.95	12.752.62	59,628.62	82
Supply and		12,380.93	12,732.02	39,028.02	02
Installation of					
Single Span Gothic					
Green House for	NR/UDS/WACWI				
WACWISA	SA/GD/002/23				

Tricycle for	NR/UDS/WACWI				
Water Tank		2,333.00	,,5,5,5,5	(10,00,2)	(52)
Supply of 1No.	22 2 22 32 32 32 32 32 32 32 32 32 32 32	5,800.00	7,676.92	(1876.92)	(32)
WACWISA	SA/GD/025/23				
System for	NR/UDS/WACWI				
Access Control		0,000.00	7,070.00	(10/0.00)	(10)
Supply of Door	574 (10/023/23	6,600.00	7,670.00	(1070.00)	(16)
WACWISA	SA/GD/023/23				
Cartridges for	NR/UDS/WACWI	300.00	810.00	04.00	7
Supply of Colour	SA/UD/022/23	900.00	816.00	84.00	9
Photocopier	SA/GD/022/23	/8.00	/2.00	6.00	8
Supply of Tyres Supply of Toners for	SA/GD/021/23 NR/UDS/WACWI	78.00	72.00	6.00	8
Supply of Tyres		2,480.00	22,88.92	(191.08)	8
ponds	SA/WK/001/23 NR/UDS/WACWI	2,480.00	22,88.92	(191.08)	8
		10,000.00	10,361.34	(561.54)	(6)
WACWISA Fabrication of Fish	SA/GD/020/23 NR/UDS/WACWI	10,000.00	10,561.54	(5(1.54)	(6)
batteries for	NR/UDS/WACWI				
Supply of tyres and	ND AID CALL CALL	350.00	400.00	(50.00)	(14)
Supply of Mower	SA/GD/019/23	250.00	400.00	(50.00)	(1.4)
G 1 CM	NR/UDS/WACWI	540.00	571.11	(31.11)	(6)
Supply of Tyres	SA/GD/018/23	F 10 00		(0.1.1.)	
G 1 CT	NR/UDS/WACWI	2,000.00	2,616.00	(616.00)	(31)
letterhead	SA/GD/016/23	2 000 00	0.41.00	/24 2 00:	(61)
Printing of	NR/UDS/WACWI	600.00	760.00	(160.00)	(27)
tricycle	SA/GD/015/23				
Supply of Farm	NR/UDS/WACWI	2,400.00	2,640.00	(240.00)	(10)
Materials	SA/GD/014/23				
Supply of Network	NR/UDS/WACWI	350.00	384.00	(34.00)	(10)
WACWISA	SA/GD/024/23				
other items for	NR/UDS/WACWI				
and Diaries and					
Supply of Calendar		9,047.62	4,944.00	4,103.62	45
1No. Printer	SA/GD/006/23				
6KVA UPS and	NR/UDS/WACWI				
Supply of 2No.		8,095.24	7,454.77	640.47	8
Computers	SA/GD/005/23				
Installation of	NR/UDS/WACWI				
Supply and		120,000.00	120,024.62	(24.62)	0
and 3.	SA/GD/004/23				
Equipment: Lot 1, 2	NR/UDS/WACWI				
Laboratory					
Installation of				,	
Supply and		285,714.28	183,490.77	102,223.51	36

# Recommendation

Specific capacity building and training of procurement officers on estimation and budgeting for the Centre to prevent future occurrence.

# **Management Response**

Recommendation is duly noted for implementation.

# 3.3.4 PROCUREMENT METHODS AND DELIVERABLES

# **Condition**

Very short period, for example one week was given to suppliers to deliver goods.

#### Recommendation

Management should ensure that suppliers abide by the time provided in the contract.

# **Management Response**

Management accepts that one-week delivery period provided for in our contract with suppliers is often inadequate. Adequate timelines would be provided going forward.

# **Comment**

The Committee agrees with the recommendation by the External Auditors.

# 3.3.6 SOURCING AND PAYMENT OF SUPPLIERS

The Director of Internal Audit reported that, no exceptions were found.

# 3.3.7 RECORD KEEPING

The Director of Internal Audit reported that, no exceptions were found.

# 3.4 SECOND QUARTER 2024 INTERNAL AUDIT REPORT OF WACWISA

The Director of Internal Audit reported that, the Internal Auditors conducted the second quarter 2024 audit of WACWISA to review the policies, procedures and governance of the Centre's initiative of the Africa Centre of Excellence.

# 3.4.1 INSTITUTIONAL IMPACT

# **Condition**

Support to UDS Business Innovation and Incubation Centre (now a Department in the School of Business) to nurture entrepreneurial innovations by faculty and students was under-scheduled.

# **Recommendations**

- 1. WACWISA Management should prioritize the allocation of resources.
- 2. Implement regular monitoring and evaluation to ensure progress towards achieving these goals.

# **Management Response**

Engagements have been held with the Vice Chancellor who has mandated the School of Business to support in the implementation and this process is currently progressing.

# **Comment**

The Audit Committee agrees with the recommendations by the Internal Auditors.

# 3.4.2 DELAY IN INSTALLATION OF LIFT AT THE WACWISA BUILDING

# **Condition**

The lift meant for the building has not been installed, despite the expected delivery period expiring on 22/06/2023, as stated in the 2023 WACWISA Procurement Plan.

# Recommendation

Measures should be put in place in procuring the lift to enable the Center to meet its implementation timelines.

# **Management Response**

The University has advertised twice for the procurement of the lift but both attempts did not result in the selection of a competent supplier. A new process for acquiring the lift has been initiated.

#### Comment

The Ag. Director of Procurement indicated that, the procurement process to install the lift has now been completed and the contractor is on site and expected to deliver in six (6) months.

# 3.4.3 NON-RECONCILIATION OF PLANNED WITH ACTUALS

# **Condition**

The WACWISA Procurement Plan was not reconciled with actuals, failing to provide the variance between actual contract sums and budgeted sums.

# Recommendation

The Ag. Director of Procurement/Procurement Coordinator should prepare a quarterly variance analysis report to provide a comprehensive view of procurement performance, aiding WACWISA Management in decision-making.

# **Management Response**

The reconciliation of the plan was yet to be done. The Ag. Directorate has taken notice of this observation and would submit the reconciliated plan as indicated.

# **Comments**

The Audit Committee agrees with the recommendation by the Internal Auditors.

# 3.4.4 WACWISA STUDENTS ENROLLMENT

#### **Condition**

Retention rate for PhD and Master's Programs as of December 2023 was 90.5%, surpassing the 90% target stated in the policy.

# Commendation

Congratulations to the WACWISA Management team for achieving this milestone.

# 3.4.5 QUALITY OF EDUCATION – PUBLICATIONS

# **Condition**

61 articles and 6 student thesis were published on the WACWISA website as at the time of the audit.

# Commendation

Recognition for effective collaboration of researchers leading to these publications.

# 3.4.6 E-LEARNING PLATFORM

# **Condition**

E-learning platform was successfully set-up with the required equipment for research and teaching.

#### Commendation

Applause for the Management's success in implementing this planned activity.

# 3.4.7 RELEVANCE OF EDUCATION – LABORATORIES EQUIPMENT

#### **Condition**

Laboratories were set up and necessary research and training equipment procured for the core site.

# Commendation

The Management Team of WACWISA were commended for meeting the policy requirements.

# 3.4.8 GREENHOUSE TECHNOLOGY

# Condition

Investment in greenhouse technology for research, training, and vegetable cultivation to generate income.

# Commendation

Commendation for strategic investment in greenhouse technology supporting the Centre's activities.

# 3.5 CONCLUSION

The Director of Internal Audit concluded the presentation by informing the Committee that, the audit has identified several strengths and areas for improvements, which are crucial for enhancing WACWISA's effectiveness and sustainability. The audit was ranked as very good.

# 4.0 ANY OTHER BUSINESS (A.O.B)

# 4.1 Regular Review of WACWISA's Project

A member of the Committee suggested that, there must be regular review of WACWISA's Project by the Audit Committee. It was also advised that, the Centre should re-look at the team that prepare the budget so that relevant reviews would be made.

# 4.2 Director of WACWISA

The Director of WACWISA thanked the Chairman, the Vice-Chancellor and the Audit Committee for the support even at a short notice. He informed the Committee that, the issues that has been raised would be taken seriously.

# 4.3 Vice-Chancellor

The Vice-Chancellor thanked the Committee for their participation and also thanked the Chairman for facilitating the meeting.

# 5.0 CHAIRMAN'S CLOSING REMARKS

The Chairman thanked the Committee members for honouring the invitation to attend the meeting. He also thanked the Vice-Chancellor and the University Management for making time for Audit Committee meetings.

# 6.0 CLOSING

In the absence of further deliberations, Ms. Clara Mama Asigri moved for the closure of the meeting and was seconded by Mr. Nurudeen I. Abubakar. A closing prayer was said by Ms. Clara Mama Asigri.

The meeting closed at 12:26 pm.

Dr. Felix Kwame Aveh

(Chairman)

Sign

Mrs. Elizabeth Boye Kuranchie-Mensah

(Secretary)