

UNIVERSITY FOR DEVELOPMENT STUDIES

Internal Audit Directorate

WACWISA PROJECT



WACWISA
Building Capacities for Sustainable Solutions



**UNIVERSITY FOR
DEVELOPMENT STUDIES**

Building Capacities for Sustainable Solutions

WACWISA

DEVELOPMENT STUDIES
UNIVERSITY FOR

AUDIT REPORT FOR THE YEAR 2023

Table of Contents

- 1.0 Executive Summary 1**
- 1.1 Summary of Significant Findings and Recommendations 1**
 - 1.1.1 Disbursement Linked Results (DLR) 1**
 - 1.1.2 Contracts Management 1**
 - 1.1.2.1 Delay in Installation of Lift at the WACWISA Building..... 2
 - 1.1.2.3 Non-reconciliation of Planned with Actuals 2
 - 1.1.2.4 Use of the same Individuals for Tender Opening and Tender Evaluation 2**
- 2.0 Introduction..... 3**
- 3.0 Background of the Audit 3**
- 4.0 Objectives of the Audit 4**
- 5.0 Scope of the Audit 4**
- 6.0 Approach and Methodology..... 4**
- 7.0 Detail Findings and Recommendations..... 5**
 - 7.1 Contract Management..... 5**
 - 7.1.1 Delay in Installation of Lift at the WACWISA Building..... 5**
 - 7.1.2 Non-reconciliation of Planned with Actuals 6**
 - 7.1.3 Use of the same Individual for Tender Opening and Tender Evaluation..... 7**
- 8.0 Conclusion 10**
- 9.0 Acknowledgment..... 10**
- 10.0 Appendices..... 11**

1.0 Executive Summary

As part of the West African Center for Water, Irrigation and Sustainable Agriculture (WACWISA) policies, the Internal Audit Directorate of the University for Development Studies (UDS) conducted an Audit of the activities of WACWISA in the University. The Audit covers the period of six months (April to September 2023). It covered both financial and non-financial activities of the Center. The following were observed during our audit.

1.1 Summary of Significant Findings and Recommendations

1.1.1 Disbursement Linked Results (DLR)

The Audit carried out revealed that the various committees and sub-committees were constituted. The Financial and Procurement Manuals of the Center and other Policy documents were all in place. Students enrollment was done in line with the policy of the Center and the financial support for PhD and Masters programs was in progress.

Under Quality of Education, the Centre facilitated the accreditation of new programs developed for PhD, Masters, and Short Courses to meet the National and International Standards. The programs are Nationally and Internationally accredited with evidence available. The E-learning Center has been set up with all the required resources. The necessary laboratory and field research equipment have also been procured and installations are in progress.

Construction of the Centre Office Complex has been completed and furnished, except for the lift which has not been installed.

A one-year extension has been granted to WACWISA-UDS to enable the University to complete its activities at no cost to the Donors and the World Bank. The core team members appointments' have been renewed effective 1st January, 2024 with their appointment letters issued to them. However, the appointment of the Procurement Officer is yet to be renewed.

1.1.2 Contracts Management

The procurement plan for WACWISA for the period was prepared and made available to the audit team. However, the following exceptions were noted; i) no variance analysis report to show the reconciliation of the estimated amount as compared to the actual, ii) the same Tender Committee members who did the bid opening for the eight (8) contracts, also evaluated those eight (8) contracts awarded instead of an Ad hoc Evaluation Panel.

1.1.2.1 Delay in Installation of Lift at the WACWISA Building

We noticed during our review that, the WACWISA Centre Office Complex was successfully completed as required. However, the Lift meant for the building has not yet been installed after the expiration of the planned expected delivery period of 22/06/2023 as stated in the 2023 WACWISA Procurement Plan

We recommend that UDS as the beneficiary institution should assist WACWISA to secure and install the lift for the building to enable WACWISA meet the implementation timelines.

1.1.2.3 Non-reconciliation of Planned with Actuals

During our review, we observed that the WACWISA Procurement Plan was not reconciled with actuals to give the variance between actual contract sums and budgeted sums

We recommend that, the Director of Procurement/Procurement Coordinator should quarterly prepare a variance analysis report at the end of every quarter to give a comprehensive view of procurement performance to help WACWISA Management in decision-making

1.1.2.4 Use of the same Individuals for Tender Opening and Tender Evaluation

During the review of the WACWISA procurement documents for the period, we noticed that the same tender committee members who did the tender opening, were the same members who also did the tender evaluation for eight (8) contracts awarded as listed in the table below.

We recommend that the Director of Procurement/Procurement Coordinator should strictly abide by WACWISA procurement guidelines and other relevant laws and regulations to avoid any sanctions from the Donors and regulatory authorities.

2.0 Introduction

WACWISA-UDS was established in 2019 as one of the Africa Centers of Excellence (ACE) for Development Impact Projects funded by the Government of Ghana and the World Bank. ACE Impact initiated the project together with other funding agencies to discover new and developing avenues to advance the borders of knowledge.

The focus of WACWISA is mainly on research and technology developments in water resources management, irrigation and sustainable agriculture. The mission is to “create a platform to develop skills and knowledge of young men and women to provide practical and sustainable solutions to challenges of water resources, irrigation and agricultural development”.

WACWISA has built capacities of graduate students through Short Courses, Masters, and PhD programs, as well as promoting teaching and learning strategies opportunity for the next generation of academics, and industry experts to address the issue of low technology.

WACWISA's core vision for the period of the project, is “to be a leading World-class Academic and Research Center specialized in irrigation, water resources, sustainable agriculture and climate change”.

The core values of WACWISA that guides its training and research include: Quality and Excellence, Unity in Diversity, Diligence and Integrity, Coaching and Mentoring and Shared Governance and Responsibility.

WACWISA under the five-way management board system together with the University Management under the leadership of the Vice Chancellor ensures that the Centers Financial and Procurement Manuals as well as other laws of the Republic of Ghana are followed to promote transparency, and avoid fraud and corruption.

3.0 Background of the Audit

The report presents the findings and recommendations of the second (2nd) and third (3rd) quarter Audit carried out by the Internal Audit Directorate of UDS. The purpose of the Audit was to evaluate the efficiency, effectiveness, and adequacy of controls and operations of the project, identify weaknesses if any, and provide recommendations for improvement

The planning and execution of the internal audit work were designed to obtain reasonable assurance that the financial and procurement systems under review were operating in accordance with relevant laws and WACWISA policies. To attain this, we examined various policies and procedures of WACWISA, internal controls, and other relevant national laws, such as the Public Procurement Act, 2003 (Act 663) as amended, the Public Procurement Manual, and the Public Financial Management Act, 2016 (Act 921) to provide a comprehensive and reliable assessment of financial management, procurements, and contracts administration and management.

4.0 Objectives of the Audit

The main objective of the WACWISA Audit was to evaluate the financial management and procurement procedures, internal controls, and compliance with policies and laws.

The audit was conducted to ascertain the following:

- to assess the achievement of DLR following the implementation policy of the Centre;
- ascertain whether the procurement procedures and processes comply with the Public Procurement Act, 2003 (Act 663) as amended;
- to evaluate the financial accounting controls of the Centre to ensure procedures are followed;
- to evaluate the financial and accounting controls of the Centre to ensure procedures are followed.

5.0 Scope of the Audit

The scope of the Audit covers all financial administration and procurements of the project for the Centre by reviewing the effectiveness of the internal controls of the system,

6.0 Approach and Methodology

In conducting the Audit, the following procedures were used:

- Conduct interviews with the project management to have much understanding of the project;
- Acquired all the necessary documents needed for the Audit;
- Examination of all the necessary documents of the project;
- Visited the project website for all the necessary information;

- Enquired for all the feedback from the previous Audit.

The following risk areas were considered in the preparation of the Audit program:

- Spending above the approved budget.
- Procurement laws and other tax laws may not be followed.
- Spending within the timeline of the project.
- Bank Reconciliation Statement not prepared on time and not reviewed.

7.0 Detail Findings and Recommendations

7.1 Contract Management

7.1.1 Delay in Installation of Lift at the WACWISA Building

Criteria

Delivery periods are set for all contract packages in the Procurement Plan and all contracts signed, indicating the expected delivery periods, the location, the contract sums, and the period of payment.

Condition

We noticed during our review that, the WACWISA Office Complex was completed successfully as required. However, the Lift meant for the building has not yet been installed after the expiration of the planned expected delivery period of 22/06/2023 as stated in the 2023 WACWISA Procurement Plan.

Cause

Difficulties in getting qualified bidders.

Effect

This could delay in the commissioning and the final handing of the project to WACWISA-UDS.

WACWISA-UDS may suffer some rating defects and loss of funds.

This will also deprive differently-abled individuals from accessing the building.

Recommendation

We recommend that UDS as the beneficiary institution should assist WACWISA to secure the lift for the building to enable WACWISA meet the implementation timelines.

Management Response

The University has advertised for the lift twice for the procurement of the lift, but none of them led to the selection of a competent supplier. Please, find attached the advert. A new process of acquiring the lift has started.

7.1.2 Non-reconciliation of Planned with Actuals

Criteria

The outcomes of a planned and actuals of a budget help maintain financial stability. Tracking the actual figures compared with the budgeted provides reliable feedback on the performance of procurements for proper decision making by management.

Condition

During our review, we observed that the WACWISA Procurement Plan was not reconciled to reflect the actual contract sums as against budgeted sums.

Cause

Non-adherence to the requirement in the provision in Act 663.

Effect

This practice could lead to budget overruns.

Also, variance analysis is not done to aid future decision making.

Recommendation

We recommend that, the Director of Procurement/Procurement Coordinator should quarterly prepare a variance analysis report at the end of every quarter in a year to give a comprehensive view of procurement performance to help WACWISA Management in decision-making.

Management Response

The reconciliation of the plan was yet to be done. The Directorate has taken notice of this observation and would submit the reconciliated plan when ready.

7.1.3 Use of the same Individual for Tender Opening and Tender Evaluation

Criteria

Paragraph 3.2 of the WACWISA Procurement Manual, 2019 states that, the University shall appoint a tender evaluation panel with the required expertise to evaluate tenders. The composition of the panel would be based on skills, knowledge, and experience relevant to the procurement requirement and may include:

- Relevant technical skills,
- End user representation,
- Procurement and contracting skills,
- Financial management and analysis skills,
- Legal expertise.

A tender evaluation panel shall, in the performance of its functions, proceed according to the predetermined and published evaluation criteria.

A tender evaluation panel shall be an ad hoc body of not more than seven (7) and not less than three (3) members.

To ensure transparency, members of the Tender Evaluation Panel shall not be directly involved in the approval of any contract award.

Condition

During the review of the WACWISA procurement documents for the period, we noticed that the same tender committee members who did the tender opening, were the same members who also did the tender evaluation for eight (8) contracts awarded as listed in the table below:

DATE	CONTRACT NUMBER	CONTRACT TITLE	AWARDEE	AMOUNT GHS	TENDER OPENING PANEL	EVALUATION PANEL
30/06/2023	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/006/2023	Supply of 16No. UPS Batteries for WACWISA Office-Lot 2	Total Supplies and Services Ltd	14,892.80	Mr. Duke A. Fredua, Mr. Muftawu Iddrisu and Mr. Abdul-Kadiri Amadu	Mr. Duke A. Fredua, Mr. Muftawu Iddrisu and Mr. Abdul-Kadiri Amadu
16/06/2023	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/014/2023	Supply of 2No. Ubiquiti LBE-MS-23 Litebeam M5 for restoration of internet for WACWISA Office-Lot 2	Dipantiche Enterprise	5,200.00	Mr. Duke A. Fredua, Mr. Muftawu Iddrisu and Mr. Abdul-Kadiri Amadu	Mr. Duke A. Fredua, Mr. Muftawu Iddrisu and Mr. Abdul-Kadiri Amadu
2/5/2023	NR/UDS/UNIDO/GD/002/2023	Contract for the training of methodology Artisans under the UNIDO Shea butter processing Technology Project, WACWISA	Munto Welding and Fabrication	18,000.00	Mr. Duke A. Fredua, Mr. Muftawu Iddrisu and Mr. Abdul-Kadiri Amadu	Mr. Duke A. Fredua, Mr. Muftawu Iddrisu and Mr. Abdul-Kadiri Amadu
11/5/2023	NR/UDS/FERARI/GD/001/2023	Supply of 1No. Projector, laptop computer and 1No. Table top fridge for FERRARI Project, WACWISA	Dipantiche Enterprise	25,138.40	Mr. Duke A. Fredua, Mr. Muftawu Iddrisu and Mr. Abdul-Kadiri Amadu	Mr. Duke A. Fredua, Mr. Muftawu Iddrisu and Mr. Abdul-Kadiri Amadu
2/5/2023	NR/UDS/UNIDO/TS/001/2023	Rental of 1No. vehicle for 20 days for UINDO Shea Butter Processing Technology Transfer	R. Zabzugu Enterprise	21,942.00	Mr. Duke A. Fredua, Mr. Muftawu Iddrisu and Mr. Abdul-Kadiri Amadu	Mr. Duke A. Fredua, Mr. Muftawu Iddrisu and Mr. Abdul-Kadiri Amadu
16/03/2023	NR/UDS/WACWISA/TS/GD/001/2023	Supply of assorted items for Sonia Ikundabayo and Chantalatu Tiku Research work	Mohash Ltd	15,723.92	Mr. Duke A. Fredua, Mr. Muftawu Iddrisu and Mr. Abdul-Kadiri Amadu	Mr. Duke A. Fredua, Mr. Muftawu Iddrisu and Mr. Abdul-Kadiri Amadu
24/02/2023	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/006/2023	Supply of 2NO. 6KVA UPS and 1NO. Printer for WACWISA Office	Total Supplies and Services Ltd	82,019.20	Mr. Duke A. Fredua, Mr. Muftawu Iddrisu and Mr. Abdul-Kadiri Amadu	Mr. Duke A. Fredua, Mr. Muftawu Iddrisu and Mr. Abdul-Kadiri Amadu
7/8/2023	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/019/2023	Supply of 1No. 5.5HP Mower for WACWISA	HTC Trading Depot Ltd	7,424.49	Mr. Duke A. Fredua, Mr. Muftawu Iddrisu and Mr. Abdul-Kadiri Amadu	Mr. Duke A. Fredua, Mr. Muftawu Iddrisu and Mr. Abdul-Kadiri Amadu

Cause

The inability of WACWISA Management to abide by the procurement procedures

Effect

Lack of segregation of duties may lead to inadequate transparency and possible compromise in the tendering and evaluation processes.

Recommendation

We recommend that the Director of Procurement/Procurement Coordinator should strictly abide by WACWISA procurement guidelines and other relevant laws and regulations to avoid any sanctions from the Donors and regulatory authorities.

Management Response

Please, the evaluation panels are not permanent. The evaluation panel is dissolved when the evaluation report is submitted. However, a person can be nominated for several times on different contracts. As you can see the dates for the evaluations of those contracts were different.

8.0 Conclusion

In conclusion, while we identified certain weaknesses and areas for improvement, it is important to note that WACWISA has made commendable progress in its mission. We believe that implementing our recommendations will further strengthen WACWISA's governance, financial and procurement management practices, and overall effectiveness.

9.0 Acknowledgment

We would like to express our appreciation for the cooperation and assistance provided by the management and staff of WACWISA throughout the audit process. We hope that the findings and recommendations outlined in this report will serve as a valuable resource in guiding WACWISA toward continued growth and success.



Abudulai Abubakari

12/2/2024

Director, Internal Audit

10.0 Appendices

Appendix. 1 Non-Installation of Lift for WACWISA Building

Contract Package*	Package Number	Estimated Amount (USD)	Final Acceptance	STATUS
Supply and Installation of Lift for WACWISA Block	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/001/23	65,714.29	22/06/2023	Not Delivered
Supply and installation of Single Span Gothic Green House for WACWISA	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/002/23	72,380.95	22/06/2023	Delivered
Supply and Installation of Laboratory Equipment for Nordic Project	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/003/23	20,000.00	22/06/2023	
Supply and Installation of Laboratory Equipment: Lot 1, 2 and 3	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/004/23	285,714.28	22/06/2023	Delivered
Supply and Installation of Computers	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/005/23	120,000.00	15/03/2023	Delivered
Supply of 2No. 6KVA UPS and 1No. Printer	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/006/23	8,095.24	08/03/2023	Delivered
Supply of Cleaning Materials and Cleaning Tools for WACWISA Block	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/007/23	5,238.09	27/06/2023	Delivered
Supply of Metal Safe	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/008/23	1,428.57	27/06/2023	Delivered
Supply and Installation of Printer and Scanner	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/009/23	4,761.90	27/06/2023	
Supply of Office Consumables	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/010/23	4,761.90	27/06/2023	Delivered
Set up of E-Learning platform	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/011/23	38,095.23	22/11/2023	Delivered
Supply of Souvenirs for WACWISA	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/012/23	7,619.04	30/11/2023	Delivered
Supply of Calendars and Diaries and other items for WACWISA	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/024/23	9,047.62	30/11/2023	Delivered
Supply of Network Materials	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/014/23	350.00	30/11/2023	Delivered
Supply of Farm tricycle	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/015/23	2,400.00	30/11/2023	
Printing of letterhead	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/016/23	600.00	30/11/2023	Delivered
Supply of ICT Materials for Maintenance Works	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/017/23	1,200.00	22/11/2023	Delivered
Supply of Tyres	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/018/23	2,000.00	30/11/2023	Delivered
Supply of Mower	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/019/23	540.00	30/11/2023	Delivered
Supply of tyres and batteries for WACWISA	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/020/23	350.00	30/11/2023	Delivered
Fabrication of Fish ponds	NR/UDS/WACWISA/WK/001/23	10,000.00	30/11/2023	
Supply of Tyres	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/021/23	2,480.00	30/11/2023	Delivered
Supply of Toners for Photocopier	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/022/23	78.00	30/11/2023	Delivered
Supply of Colour Cartridges for WACWISA	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/023/23	900.00	30/11/2023	Delivered
Supply of Door Access Control System for WACWISA	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/025/23	6,600.00	30/11/2023	Delivered
Supply of 1No. Water Tank Tricycle for WACWISA	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/026/23	5,800.00	30/11/2023	Delivered
Supply of 1No. Motorcycle for Delivery Services	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/027/23	1,200.00	30/11/2023	Check for Delivery
Supply of Reagents for WACWISA Laboratory	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/028/23	6,600.00	30/11/2023	Delivered
Supply of Glassware and Consumables for WACWISA Laboratory	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/029/23	6,500.00	30/11/2023	Delivered
Total Cost		690,455.11		

Appendix 3. Non-reconciliation of Planned with Actuals

Contract Package*	Plan vs. Actual	Package Number	Estimated Amount (USD)	Final Acceptance	Final Cost USD
Supply and Installation of Lift for WACWISA Block	Plan	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/001/23	65,714.29	22/06/2023	65,714.29
	Actual				
Supply and installation of Single Span Gothic Green House for WACWISA	Plan	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/002/23	72,380.95	22/06/2023	72,380.95
	Actual				
Supply and Installation of Laboratory Equipment for Nordic Project	Plan	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/003/23	20,000.00	22/06/2023	20,000.00
	Actual				
Supply and Installation of Laboratory Equipment: Lot 1, 2 and 3	Plan	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/004/23	285,714.28	22/06/2023	285,714.28
	Actual				
Supply and Installation of Computers	Plan	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/005/23	120,000.00	15/03/2023	120,000.00
	Actual				
Supply of 2No. 6KVA UPS and 1No. Printer	Plan	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/006/23	8,095.24	08/03/2023	8,095.24
	Actual				
Supply of Cleaning Materials and Cleaning Tools for WACWISA Block	Plan	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/007/23	5,238.09	27/06/2023	5,238.09
	Actual				
Supply of Metal Safe	Plan	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/008/23	1,428.57	27/06/2023	1,428.57
	Actual				
Supply and Installation of Printer and Scanner	Plan	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/009/23	4,761.90	27/06/2023	4,761.90
	Actual				
Supply of Office Consumables	Plan	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/010/23	4,761.90	27/06/2023	4,761.90
	Actual				
Set up of E-Learning platform	Plan	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/011/23	38,095.23	22/11/2023	38,095.23
	Actual				
Supply of Souvenirs for WACWISA	Plan	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/012/23	7,619.04	30/11/2023	7,619.04
	Actual				
Supply of Calendars and Diaries and other items for WACWISA	Plan	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/024/23	9,047.62	30/11/2023	9,047.62
	Actual				
Supply of Network Materials	Plan	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/014/23	350.00	30/11/2023	350.00
	Actual				
Supply of Farm tricycle	Plan	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/015/23	2,400.00	30/11/2023	2,400.00
	Actual				
Printing of letterhead	Plan	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/016/23	600.00	30/11/2023	600.00
	Actual				
Supply of ICT Materials for Maintenance Works	Plan	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/017/23	1,200.00	22/11/2023	1,200.00
	Actual				
Supply of Tyres	Plan	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/018/23	2,000.00	30/11/2023	2,000.00
	Actual				
Supply of Mower	Plan	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/019/23	540.00	30/11/2023	540.00
	Actual				
Supply of tyres and batteries for WACWISA	Plan	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/020/23	350.00	30/11/2023	350.00
	Actual				
Fabrication of Fish ponds	Plan	NR/UDS/WACWISA/WK/001/23	10,000.00	30/11/2023	10,000.00
	Actual				
Supply of Tyres	Plan	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/021/23	2,480.00	30/11/2023	2,480.00
	Actual				
Supply of Toners for Photocopier	Plan	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/022/23	78.00	30/11/2023	78.00
	Actual				
Supply of Colour Cartridges for WACWISA	Plan	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/023/23	900.00	30/11/2023	900.00
	Actual				
Supply of Door Access Control System for WACWISA	Plan	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/025/23	6,600.00	30/11/2023	6,600.00
	Actual				
Supply of 1No. Water Tank Tricycle for WACWISA	Plan	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/026/23	5,800.00	30/11/2023	5,800.00
	Actual				
Supply of 1No. Motorcycle for Delivery Services	Plan	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/027/23	1,200.00	30/11/2023	1,200.00
	Actual				
Supply of Reagents for WACWISA Laboratory	Plan	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/028/23	6,600.00	30/11/2023	6,600.00

	Actual				
Supply of Glassware and Consumables for WACWISA Laboratory	Plan	NR/UDS/WACWISA/GD/029/23	6,500.00	30/11/2023	6,500.00
	Actual				
Total Cost	Plan		690,455.11		690,455.11
	Actual				