# UNIVERSITY FOR DEVELOPMENT STUDIES (UDS) MINUTES OF THE AUDIT COMMITTEE (AC) MEETING HELD IN THE COUNCIL CHAMBER & VIA ZOOM FRIDAY, AUGUST 12, 2022

#### **ATTENDANCE**

## **Members present**

Dr. Felix Kwame Aveh
 Ms. Clara Mama Asigri
 Member/Rep. ICAG
 Mr. Abdulai Mohammed
 Member/Rep. IAA

4. Dr. Mrs. Sanatu Mustapha Alidu - Member/Rep. UDS Council

# **Co-opted Members**

Prof. Gabriel A. Teye
 Mr. Nurudeen I. Abubakar
 Member/Rep. Mgt.
 Member/Rep. Mgt.

#### In Attendance

1. Dr. Mohammed H. Shaibu - Director of Finance

2. Mr. John A. Azure - Director of Internal Audit

3. Mr. Rashid Yakubu - Secretary

#### **Absent with Apology**

1. Rev. Dr. Mrs. Grace Sintim Adasi - Member/Rep. UDS Council

NO	DISCUSSIONS	ACTION
1.0	OPENING	
2.0	The meeting commenced at 9:04 am with an opening prayer by Mr. John A. Azure.  WELCOME	
	The Chairman welcomed members and explained that he had to participate in the meeting via zoom because of the delays and subsequent cancellation of the scheduled flight from Accra to Tamale on the day. He then requested members of the Committee to state their interest on any of the items on the Agenda before the	

meeting commenced.

The Chairman reminded the Secretary to the Committee about the importance, and also as a requirement to include in the agenda of every meeting of the Committee a prompt for members to express their interest on issues to be discussed. The Chairman in the absence of any expression of conflict of interest proceeded with the meeting.

Secretary

3.0

# CONFIRMATION OF THE MINUTES OF THE COMMITTEE'S MEETING THAT WAS HELD ON WEDNESDAY, MAY 18, 2022

The minutes of the meeting that was held on Wednesday, May 18, 2022 were read and the motion for its acceptance was moved by Mr. Abdulai Mohammed and seconded by Dr. Mrs. Sanatu Mustapha Alidu subject to the following corrections.

- 1. Page 2, item 3.1.0 paragraph 1, line 3...external reports...was corrected to...external audits reports. Also, paragraph 2, line 1...aside from reviewing the various audited reports...was corrected to...aside reviewing various audit reports.
- 2. Page 5, paragraph 2, line 3...He therefore edged...was corrected to...he therefore urged.
- 3. Page 9, item 8.0, line 2...MANAGEMENT OF THE TAMALE CAMPUS...was corrected to...MANAGEMENT ON TAMALE CAMPUS.
- 4. Page 11, item 8.4.0, paragraph 1, line 3...a Committee to handle....was corrected to...a Committee to handle issues on transport.
- 5. Page 13, item 9.0, paragraph 3, line 3...Public Financial Regulation Act...was corrected to...Public Financial Management Act, 2016 Act 921. Also, paragraph 4, line 4...year ending...was corrected to...year ended.
- 6. Page 17, item 10.4.0, paragraph 1, line 2...debtors...was corrected to...debts.

#### 4.0

#### **MATTERS ARISING**

#### 4.1.0 MANAGEMENT

## 4.1.1 2021 Annual Audit Report

Management reported to the Committee that the 2021 Annual Audit Report was completed and submitted to the Minister of Education.

## **4.1.2** Training and Development

Following on the status of implementation of the recommendations of the 2022 first quarter internal audit report and the request for Management to direct the Deans, Directors and the Heads of Departments to ensure that the Training and Development Unit was informed about any training they intended to conduct. Management reported that the directive of the Audit Committee was carried out and that no training would be conducted without the notice of the Training and Development Unit.

Management

#### **4.1.3** Staff Training Database

The Committee was also informed that a database on the standing of staff training was being developed by the Training and Development Unit as directed by the Committee.

Management

#### 4.1.4 Vehicle Maintenance Planner

According to Management, the training of the Tamale Campus Assistant Transport Officers on the preparation of vehicles maintenance planners could not take place because the scheduled date conflicted with the TTFPP programme as the drivers where directly involved with the activities of the programme.

## 4.1.5 Service Agreement

Management informed the Audit Committee that a service agreement with Service Providers of the University was in place and signed.

#### 4.1.6 Comments

The Chairman of the Committee underscored the significance of Management constituting a Transport Management Committee whose responsibilities he indicated should oversee the various aspects of managing the University's vehicles. The Audit Committee therefore tasked Management to constitute a Transport Management Committee for the University.

Management

**5.0** 

## **BUSINESS OF THE DAY (B.O.D)**

# 5.1.0 INVITATION TO UDS TO THE PUBLIC SITTINGS OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE OF PARLIAMENT

Management reported that the appearance of the University at the public sitting of the Public Accounts Committee of Parliament on Wednesday, July 20, 2022 was in respect of infractions that were detected from the Financial Statement for the Year Ended 31<sup>st</sup> December, 2017. According to Management, the observations were hinged on; the payment of unearned salaries to staff, failure to recover advances from staff, and the acceptance of two instead of a minimum of three quotations from suppliers for the procurement of goods and services.

The Audit Committee was informed that the appearance of the University at the Public Accounts Committee of Parliament and the responses that were subsequently provided to the Committee were well received. According to Management, the University was as a result discharged and cautioned to guard against such breaches in future.

#### 5.1.1 Comments

The Chairman of the Audit Committee expressed the Committee's displeasure about the University's appearance at the Public Accounts Committee of Parliament. According to the Chairman, such appearance does not portray a good image of the institution. He furthered that the repercussions of breaching the

Public Financial Management Act, 2016 Act 921 was enormous and included prosecution and possible jail terms for duty bearers.

He added that the violations and subsequent invitation for the University to appear at the Public Accounts Committee of Parliament also impacted negatively on the reputation of the University. Such invitations he stated were not only observed as indictment on the University but also blemished the integrity of members of the Audit Committee.

The Chairman consequently pointed out that the Audit Committee would not take kindly to actions of Management that might result in the University being hauled to the Public Account Committee going forward. He therefore advised Management to avoid taking actions or inactions that might result in the University's appearance at the Public Account Committee of Parliament.

#### 5.2.0 MEMOS TO REGISTRAR

The Audit Committee at its last regular meeting tasked the Internal Audit Directorate to write to the Registrar to take action on the recommendations of the Directorate's audit report on Planning and Human Resource issues at the Central Administration. The directive was reported to have been carried out and that, the Registrar had taken action on the recommendations. The Director of Internal Audit subsequently submitted copies of the memos that were written to the Registrar as evidence of action taken.

According to the Director of Internal Audit the memo updating the Registrar on the status of implementation of the Internal Audit Directorate's findings and recommendations was also written. He stated that, a follow up with the Heads of Transportation, and Training and Development Units however indicated that about seven concerns of the Transport Department, and an issue with the Training and Development Unit were yet to be addressed. According to the Director of Internal Audit the Departments were therefore requested to ensure that the outstanding issues were resolved.

Management

#### 5.3.0 MEMOS TO THE DIRECTOR OF PROCUREMENT

The Director of Internal Audit reported that the attention of the Director of Procurement was drawn to various infractions that were observed from the second quarter of 2022 audit report on procurement at the Tamale Campus that were referred to the Procurement Directorate for necessary action. Some of the observations according to the audit included; the non-existence of Campus Procurement Advisory Committee for the Schools of Nursing and Midwifery, Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences, and Allied Health Sciences. The lack of a supplier database, the absence of procurement manual to guide procurement officers and procedures were all noted to be needing. The audit report therefore recommended that all observations from the audit should be rectified.

Management

#### 5.3.1 Comments

The Audit Committee observed from the audit report and the responses of Management that, the audit failed to broadly consult the Registrar on some of the observations, findings and the responses that were professed by the audit clients.

The meeting also noted that, the observation of the non-existence of a suppliers database did not appreciate the fact that the law on sourcing for suppliers had changed and currently requiring that, Suppliers were sought from the website of the Public Procurement Authority (PPA) Standardised Suppliers Database. The Committee therefore advised the Internal Audit Directorate to ensure that follow ups on audit observations responses were confirmed with the Registrar before the audit reports were finalised and issued.

The Chairman of the Audit Committee recommended that the Registrar should ensure that all staff responding to audit observations on his behalf informed or updated him on their responses to the audit observations or findings before such responses were submitted to the auditors.

The Audit Committee again observed as unacceptable the responses of "noted" by audit clients to almost every audit observation. The Committee therefore

directed that going forward proper answers, rather than "noted" should be provided.

# 5.4.0 SECOND QUARTER OF 2022 HUMAN RESOURCE PLANNING AUDIT REPORT – CENTRAL ADMINISTRATION

The Human Resource (HR) Planning and Research Unit Audit report for the Central Administration was to establish whether there were internal controls regulating the work of the Human Resource Planning and Research Unit. It was particularly to determine the; scope of planning on human resource, research into staff and students planning, maintaining up to date electronic records of staff, and monitoring higher performance indicators in the University. The overriding essence was to ensure that the work of the Human Resource and Planning and Research Unit was in consonance with the University Statute, Management policies and other Administrative regulations of the University.

According to the audit report, the Planning and Research Unit of the Human Resource Department was on top of the issues with regards to the policies and mandate, and the procedures of the Department. The audit report however observed that there was no specific and standard organisational chart for the University and that, the existing Human Resource system for the management of staff database was being updated.

#### 5.4.1 Comments

Management

Management in response to the observation of the absence of an operational specific organisational chart disagreed with the findings and explained that the University had a standard organisational chart but it was yet to be approved by the Governing Council.

# 5.5.0 SECOND QUARTER OF 2022 HUMAN RESOURCE AUDIT ON STAFF RESIGNATIONS

The Human Resource Audit report on staff resignations was to establish whether there were laid down policies and procedures with regards to the termination of appointments by resignation and whether such operations were in line with the policies, regulations and laws of the State. The audit was to further determine whether such resignations procedures were effective enough to ensure the University achieved its objectives.

The audit observed that the University's policy documents on the termination of appointment by resignation were inconsistent with the Labour Act, 2003 Act 651. Hence, the recommendation that Management should seek advice from the University's Lawyers for the drafting and interpretation of the policy documents.

Management

According to the audit, seven staff who had resigned from the University were detected to have been paid unearned salaries amounting to 64,624.04GHS. The report noted that the irregularities were occasioned by weak staff validation processes. The audit subsequently recommended that Management should recover all the monies from the staff.

Management

## **5.5.1** Notice of Termination of Appointment by Resignations

The audit detected that the period of notification of the termination of appointment by resignation was problematic. According to the report, eleven staff who resigned from the University gave less than one month prior notice before terminating their appointments. The audit subsequently recommended that the Human Resource Department should ensure that the policies on staff resignations were strictly enforced.

Management

The non-completion of clearance forms by staff who were resigning from the University was also observed by the audit as a violation. Thirteen staff were detected to have resigned from the University without completing the University clearance forms. In view of that, the report recommended that Management should mandate or introduce an enforcement system requiring all staff quitting the University to submit completed and endorsed clearance forms for consideration before their requests were granted or otherwise.

Management

#### 5.5.2 Comments

The House noted that the issues about the payment of unearned salaries were very critical and that Management should make an effort to retrieve all such payments before the next and successive visits by the External Auditors.

Members also called for coordination between the Registrar, Director of Finance and the Head of Human Resource to halt the payment of unearned salaries to staff.

The Chairman of the Audit Committee subsequent to the discussions on the audit report advised Management to ensure that exit meetings were held with staff resigning from the University. According to the Chairman, such meetings would inform Management about the institutional occurrences that were instigating the resignation in enable measures to be taken to address or curtail such incidents. He however noted that since such staff could not also be restricted in their decisions to resign, the outcome of all the processes leading to their exit through the exit meetings could be well documented for the records.

# 5.6.0 SECOND QUARTER OF 2022 ON PROCUREMENT AND CONTRACT MANAGEMENT AUDIT – TAMALE CAMPUS

The audit report for the second quarter of 2022 on procurement and contract management at the Tamale Campus was conducted to ascertain whether the Procurement Unit had a procurement manual, and to find out the frequency of meeting of the Procurement Advisory Committee (PAC). The audit was to also determine whether the Campus Procurement Unit complied with the threshold set by the Central Administration for the procurement of goods and services.

The findings from the audit centred on the; non-existence of a Procurement Advisory Committee (PAC) at the Schools of Allied Health Science, Nursing and Midwifery, and Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences, absence of procurement manual, non-inclusion of technical persons in evaluation panel for the procurement of air conditioners, absence of a suppliers database and no price banks for evaluation and comparison of tenders

The audit subsequently proposed recommendations on the observations in line with the procurement and contract management guidelines. It for instance recommended that a technical person with expertise in air conditioners and other items of technical nature should be empaneled at meetings to evaluate tenders. It further recommended that, the Procurement Directorate should develop an operational guide for its officers at the Tamale Campus.

Management

The audit client in response to the observation of the absence of a price bank for the Campus Procurement Unit explained that, the Procurement Directorate relied on the Public Procurement Authority (PPA) price bank and through competitive bidding. Again the audit client explained that the University as a public entity depended solely on the Public Procurement manual as a guide to its procurement activities. Hence, the Procurement Directorate and its Units depended on the PPA Procurement manual.

#### 5.6.1 Comments

The Committee noted that the observation of the audit to the effect that the Tamale Campus had no Campus Procurement Advisory Committee (CPAC) contradicted its observations of; no meeting schedule, no meetings or minutes of meetings of the CPAC from January, 2022 to June, 2022 as the same report recognised that meetings were held except that minutes of such meetings were not taken.

The Registrar affirmed the Committee's observation on the existence of CPAC but added that minutes of the CPAC meetings were usually not taken. He however assured the Audit Committee that going forward minutes of CPAC meetings would be taken. The Chairman following on the assurance from the Register directed that henceforth, minutes of CPAC meetings should be taken.

The Chairman in respect of the observations from the Procurement and Contract Management audit report of the Tamale Campus for the second quarter of 2022 underscored the relevance of the recommendations by the report. He therefore suggested that, the Registrar and Director of Finance should consider the responses from the report and direct their subordinates to at all times confer with them on all audit observations before they issued responses on their behalf.

#### ANY OTHER BUSINESS (A. O. B.)

The Committee recommended that Management should appraise the University's attendance at the Public Account Committee of Parliament (PAC) and find ways

6.0

to avoid future invitation to PAC on grounds of violations. The Committee further professed the following;

- That Management should immediately address all the issues on unearned salaries and ensure that such payments were retrieved.
- Address all procurement issues by ensuring that procurement guidelines and thresholds were not breached.
- Promote effective communication between the various Directorates and Units by coordinating their activities.
- Enhance coordination between the Registry, Directorate of Finance and the Directorate of Internal Audit in respect of all audit observations.

#### **END OF TERMS OF OFFICE**

The Registrar informed the Audit Committee that, the Vice-Chancellor, and the Director of Internal Audit were attending the Audit Committee meeting for the last time as their tenure were to end in September, 2022 and August, 2022 respectively. He added that the Secretary had also been reassigned to a different responsibility but assured the Committee that, an equally worthy staff would be assigned to serve the Committee as a Secretary.

#### 7.1.0 Vice-Chancellor (VC)

The Vice-Chancellor, Prof. Gabriel Ayum Teye thanked the Audit Committee, especially the Chairman for his contributions in shaping and providing guidance to Management and the Committee. He also thanked the immediate past membership and Chairman of the Audit Committee for their good guidance. He informed the Committee that, a new Vice-Chancellor had been appointed by the Governing Council to replace him. He therefore wished the Committee would extend warm support to the incoming Vice-Chancellor to enable the new administration contribute its quota to the development of the University.

#### 7.2.0 Director of Internal Audit

11

**7.0** 

The Director of Internal Audit, Mr. John Akolgo Azure expressed appreciation to Members and the Chairman of the Audit Committee. He indicated that, he would be working with the Registrar and Director of Finance as he finalises his exit on retirement from the University. He informed the Audit Committee that an Acting Director would be attending the Committee's meeting until a substantive Director of Internal Audit was appointed. He therefore appealed to the Committee to extend to the Acting Director the necessary support.

#### 7.3.0 Comments

8.0

Members of the Committee noted that an efficient Audit Committee to a broader extent depended on an effective Audit Committee Secretariat. The Committee therefore encouraged Management to continue to maintain an efficient Audit Committee Secretariat. Members further commended the Secretary of the Committee for his efficiency to work and implored Management to continue with such high principles of the Audit Committee Secretariat.

#### CHAIRMAN'S CLOSING REMARKS

9.0

The Chairman of the Audit Committee in his closing remarks applauded the Vice-Chancellor and the Director of Internal Audit for regularly attending the Committee's meeting. He also thanked them for their patience and diligence to work. He concluded by wishing the Vice-Chancellor, and the Director of Internal Audit well and hoped that, they would be readily available whenever the Committee needed their counsel.

#### **CLOSING**

The motion to end the meeting was moved and seconded by Mr. Abdulai Mohammed and Dr. Mrs. Sanatu Mustapha Alidu respectively.

The closing prayer was said by Mama Clara Asigri.

The meeting closed at 12:00 pm.

Sign....

Dr. Felix Kwame Aveh

(Chairman)

Sign...........

Mr. Rashid Yakubu

(Secretary)